# Evolution of circumstellar disks and planet formation

## Wladimir (Wlad) Lyra

Sagan Fellow

**Caltech - JPL** 



João Alves (Vienna), Axel Brandenburg (Stockholm), Mario Flock (Paris), Saavik Ford (NYC), Sebastien Fromang (Paris), Anders Johansen (Lund), Tobias Heinemann (KITP), Hubert Klahr (Heidelberg), Marc Kuchner (Goddard), Min-Kai Lin (CITA), Mordecai-Mark Mac Low (AMNH), Barry McKernan (NYC), Colin McNally (NBI), Sijme-Jan Paardekooper (Cambridge), Nikolai Piskunov (Uppsala), Natalie Raettig (Heidelberg), Zsolt Sándor (Budapest), Neal Turner (JPL), Andras Zsom (MIT).

> Western Washington University, Bellingham WA Jan 29<sup>th</sup>, 2015



# Outline

- Turbulence in disks
  - Active and dead zones
  - Magneto-rotational and baroclinic instability
  - Vortices and elliptic instability
- Active/dead boundary
  - Rossby wave instability
- The vortex-mode of planet formation
- Observational constraints

## **Protoplanetary Disks**





## Accretion in disks occurs via turbulent viscosity

Turbulence in disks is enabled by the Magneto-Rotational Instability



## Accretion in disks occurs via turbulent viscosity

Turbulence in disks is enabled by the Magneto-Rotational Instability



## **Magneto-Rotational Instability**

Turbulence and Accretion in 3D Global MHD Simulations of Stratified Protoplanetary Disk

Video credit: Mario Flock (MPIA/CEA)

## **Particle drift**



## **Pressure Trap**



Adapted from Whipple (1972)

## **Pressure Trap**



Stellocentric distance

## **Turbulence concentrates solids mechanically in pressure maxima**



## Gravitational collapse into planetesimals



Johansen et al. (2007)

#### Dead zones are robust features of protoplanetary disks



Disks are cold and thus poorly ionized

(Blaes & Balbus 1994)

Therefore, accretion is layered

(Gammie 1996)

There should be a magnetized, active zone, and a non-magnetic, dead zone.



azimuth

## A simple dead zone model



radius

Lyra et al. (2008b, 2009a); See also Varniere & Tagger (2006)

## Vortices – an ubiquitous fluid mechanics phenomenon











## Vortices – an ubiquitous fluid mechanics phenomenon







## Von Kármán vortex street





## The Tea-Leaf effect



Particles do not feel the pressure gradient. They sink towards the center, where they accumulate.

#### Aid to planet formation

(Barge & Sommeria 1995, Adams & Watkins 1996, Tanga et al. 1996)

#### Speed up planet formation enormously

(Lyra et al. 2008b, 2009ab, Raettig et al. 2012)

## The Tea-Leaf effect





Raettig et al. (2012, 2015)

Particles do not feel the pressure gradient. They sink towards the center, where they accumulate.

#### Aid to planet formation

(Barge & Sommeria 1995, Adams & Watkins 1996, Tanga et al. 1996)

#### Speed up planet formation enormously

(Lyra et al. 2008b, 2009ab, Raettig et al. 2012, 2015)

#### **Vortices and Planet Formation**



#### Collapse into Mars mass objects

(Lyra et al. 2008b, 2009a, see also Lambrechts & Johansen 2012)

#### **Vortices and Planet Formation**



#### Collapse into Mars mass objects

(Lyra et al. 2008b, 2009a, see also Lambrechts & Johansen 2012)

## **Rapid formation of planetary cores**



Lambrechts & Johansen (2012)

#### The energy cascade



## Sustaining vortices in disks

Known mechanisms to *replenish* the *vorticity* lost in the direct cascade

## **Baroclinic instability**

(Convective overstability)



Klahr & Bodenheimer (2003), Klahr (2004), Johnson & Gammie (2005), Petersen et al. (2007ab), Lesur & Papaloizou (2010), Lyra & Klahr (2011), Raettig et al. (2013) Klahr & Hubbard (2014), Lyra (2014)

Powered by: Buyoancy, thermal diffusion (baroclinic source term)

## Rossby wave instability



Lovelace & Hohlfeld (1978), Toomre (1981), Papaloizou & Pringle (1984, 1985), Hawley et al. (1987), Lovelace et al. (1999), Li et al. (2000,2011), Tagger (2001), Varniere & Tagger (2006), de Val-Borro et al. (2007), Lyra et al. (2008b,2009ab), Mehuet et al. (2010, 2012abc), Lin & Papaloizou (2011ab, 2012), Lyra & Mac Low (2012), Regaly et al. (2012, 2013), Lin (2012ab, 2013), Ataiee et al. (2013, 2014), Lyra et al. (2014)

> Powered by: Modification of shear profile (external vorticity reservoir)

#### **Baroclinic Instability – Excitation and self-sustenance of vortices**

Sketch of the Baroclinic Instability



Lesur & Papaloizou (2010)

Armitage (2010)

#### **Baroclinic Instability – Excitation and self-sustenance of vortices**

1. Radial entropy gradient

2. Thermal diffusion

# Sketch of the Baroclinic Instability



Lesur & Papaloizou (2010)



Armitage (2010)

#### **Baroclinic Instability – Excitation and self-sustenance of vortices**



#### The "Baroclinic Instability" is LINEAR (Convective Overstability)

Klahr & Hubbard (2014), Lyra (2014)



#### **Baroclinic instability and layered accretion**

What happens when the vortex is magnetized?



Lyra & Klahr (2011)



#### **Baroclinic instability and layered accretion**

What happens when the vortex is magnetized?





### Fluid in rigid rotation supports a spectrum of oscillations



## Fluid in rigid rotation supports a spectrum of oscillations



#### Introducing ellipticity: Strain



#### **Elliptic Instability**



Lesur & Papaloizou (2009) After Bayly (1986)



Vortex coherence is destroyed. Energy cascades forward and dissipates. The flow relaminarizes.

McWilliams (2010)

#### **Elliptic Instability**



Lesur & Papaloizou (2009) After Bayly (1986)



Vortex coherence is destroyed Energy cascades forward and dissipates The flow relaminarizes

McWilliams (2010)

#### **Elliptic Instability**





Vortex coherence is destroyed Energy cascades forward and dissipates The flow relaminarizes

McWilliams (2010)
# **Magneto-Elliptic Instability**





#### Infinitely elongated vortices are equivalent to shear flows.

They are subject to an MRI-like instability when magnetized.

# Rossby Wave Instability (or.... Kelvin-Helmholtz in rotating disks)











# **Planetary gap RWI**

(de Val-Borro et al. 2006, 2007)

*t*= 0.1







Planet tides carve gap

Gap walls are unstable to Kelvin-Helmholtz instability

Lyra (2009)

# **Planetary gap RWI**

Lyra et al. (2009b), see also de Val-Borro et al. (2007)



"Secondary" planet formation burst following the formation of a giant planet.

# Vortex trapping



Lyra et al. (2009b)

#### Peggy Varnière & Michel Tagger RWI at dead zone boundary

#### Reviving Dead Zones in Accretion Disks by Rossby Vortices at their Boundaries

P. Varnière<sup>1,2</sup> & M. Tagger<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Physics & Astronomy, Rochester University, Rochester NY 14627-0171

<sup>2</sup> LAOG, Université J. Fourier UMR 5571 France, e-mail: pvarni@pas.rochester.edu

<sup>3</sup> Service d'Astrophysique (UMR Astroparticules et cosmologie) CEA/Saclay F-91191 Gif sur Yvette e-mail: tagger@cea.fr

the date of receipt and acceptance should be inserted later

Abstract. Models of the accretion disks of Young Stellar Objects show that they should not be ionized at a few AU from the star, and thus not subject to the MHD turbulence believed to cause accretion. This has been suggested to create a 'Dead Zone' where accretion remains unexplained. Here we show that the existence of the Dead Zone self-consistently creates a density profile favorable to the Rossby Wave Instability of Lovelace et al. (1999). This instability will create and sustain Rossby vortices in the disk which could lead to enhanced planet formation.

Key words. accretion disks; Instabilities; planetary systems: formation



Fig. 1. Profile of the  $\alpha$ -viscosity implemented to represent a Dead Zone between 1 and 5 AU with  $(\epsilon, \delta_r) = (10^{-5}, 50)$ .



Fig. 3. Zoom of the first 2 inner AU of the simulation at t = 0,100,200,300 years, showing the density. One sees three vortices forming, later evolving to two vortices, near the outer edge of the Dead Zone.

Varnière & Tagger (2006)

#### **Vortices and Planet Formation**



#### Collapse into Mars mass objects

(Lyra et al. 2008b, 2009a, see also Lambrechts & Johansen 2012)

#### Active/dead zone boundary



Lyra & Mac Low (2012)

#### Active/dead zone boundary



#### A possible detection of vortices in disks?



## **Oph IRS 48**



#### A Major Asymmetric Dust Trap in a Transition Disk

Nienke van der Marel,<sup>1</sup>\* Ewine F. van Dishoeck,<sup>1,2</sup> Simon Bruderer,<sup>2</sup> Til Birnstiel,<sup>3</sup> Paola Pinilla,<sup>4</sup> Cornelis P. Dullemond,<sup>4</sup> Tim A. van Kempen,<sup>1,5</sup> Markus Schmalzl,<sup>1</sup> Joanna M. Brown,<sup>3</sup> Gregory J. Herczeg,<sup>6</sup> Geoffrey S. Mathews,<sup>1</sup> Vincent Geers<sup>7</sup>

The statistics of discovered exoplanets suggest that planets form efficiently. However, there are fundamental unsolved problems, such as excessive inward drift of particles in protoplanetary disks during planet formation. Recent theories invoke dust traps to overcome this problem. We report the detection of a dust trap in the disk around the star Oph IRS 48 using observations from the Atacama Large Millimeter/submillimeter Array (ALMA). The 0.44-millimeter-wavelength continuum map shows high-contrast crescent-shaped emission on one side of the star, originating from millimeter-sized grains, whereas both the mid-infrared image (micrometer-sized dust) and the gas traced by the carbon monoxide 6-5 rotational line suggest rings centered on the star. The difference in distribution of big grains versus small grains/gas can be modeled with a vortex-shaped dust trap triggered by a companion.

lthough the ubiquity of planets is con- tion mechanism of planetary systems in disks firmed almost daily by detections of of gas and dust around young stars remains a new exoplanets (1), the exact forma- long-standing problem in astrophysics (2). In

iencemag.org SCIENCE VOL 340 7 JUNE 2013

1199

Down

#### van der Marel et al. 2013

A possible huge vortex observed with ALMA



asymmetric mm dust at 63 AU

Gas detection: Keplerian rotation

Micron-sized dust follows gas

# **Drag-Diffusion Equilibrium**



Trapped particle

# **Drag-Diffusion Equilibrium**



Trapped particle

# **Drag-Diffusion Equilibrium**



#### Analytical solution for dust trapping



Solution  

$$\rho_d(a) = \rho_{d\max} \exp\left(-\frac{a^2}{2H_V^2}\right),$$

$$H_V = \frac{H}{f(\chi)} \sqrt{\frac{1}{S+1}}$$

$$S = \frac{St}{\delta}$$
$$\delta = v_{\rm rms}^2 / c_{\rm s}^2$$

a = vortex semi-minor axis H = disk scale height (temperature)  $\chi = \text{vortex aspect ratio}$   $\delta = \text{diffusion parameter}$  St = Stokes number (particle size) $f(\chi) = \text{model-dependent scale function}$ 

# Analytical solution for dust trapping



# **Analytical vs Numerical**



#### **Derived quantities**



H = disk scale height (temperature)St = Stokes number (particle size) $\chi = \text{vortex aspect ratio}$  $f(\chi) = \text{model-dependent scale function}$  $\delta = \text{diffusion parameter}$  $\epsilon = \text{dust-to-gas ratio}$ 





1.0

Lyra & Lin (2013)

0.5

0.0

△RA(")

-0.5

-1.0

asymmetric mm dust at 63 AU

Gas detection: Keplerian rotation

Micron-sized dust follows gas

#### **Turbulence in vortex cores**



Lesur & Papaloizou (2010)

Lyra & Klahr (2011)

0.0

х

0.1

0.2

-0.1

 $u_z/c_s$ 0.0

-0.1

0.1

Turbulence in vortex cores:

max at ~10% of sound speed rms at ~3% of sound speed

# HD 142527







# It seems to have the properties of vortices.

# But... is it really a vortex?

# The dust trap is too far from the planet!



A gap in gas emission suggests a 10 MJ planet at **15-20 AU**.

The trap is centered at 63 AU.

# Still "sorta" possible



# **Convective overstability**



# The thermal diffusion time for the gas in IRS Oph 48 is 0.1 orbits.

Too close to isothermal for convective overstability

# **Outer Dead/Active zone transition RWI fails!**



# The **outer** dead zone transition in ionization is **TOO SMOOTH** to generate an RWI-unstable bump.

# Outer Dead/Active zone transition RWI does NOT fail!



Resistive inner disk + magnetized outer disk Lyra et al (2015)

# **Outer Dead/Active zone transition RWI**



Lyra et al (2015)

## **Outer Dead/Active zone transition RWI**





FIG. 9.—Saturation level of the Maxwell stress as a function of the magnetic Reynolds number  $\text{Re}_{M0}$ . Open circles and triangles denote the models without Hall term  $(X_0 = 0)$  for  $\beta_0 = 3200$  and 12,800, respectively. The models including the Hall term are shown by filled circles  $(X_0 = 4)$  and triangles  $(X_0 = -2)$ .

Lyra et al. (2015)

Sano and Stone (2002)

- Vortices exist in the dead zone only
- Two sustenance modes: Rossby Wave Instability and Convective Overstability
- Vortex-assisted and streaming instability are complementary
- Vortex-trapped dust in drag-diffusion equilibrium explains the observations
- Rossby wave instability may be the culprit of these dust traps



- Vortices exist in the dead zone only
- Two sustenance modes: Rossby Wave Instability and Convective Overstability
- Vortex-assisted is a complementary formation mode to streaming instability
- Vortex-trapped dust in drag-diffusion equilibrium explains the observations
- Rossby wave instability may be the culprit of these dust traps



- Vortices exist in the dead zone only
- Two sustenance modes: Rossby Wave Instability and Convective Overstability
- Vortex-assisted and streaming instability are complementary
- Vortex-trapped dust in drag-diffusion equilibrium explains the observations
- Rossby wave instability may be the culprit of these dust traps
   or our model predictions:





- Vortices exist in the dead zor
- Two sustenance modes: Ros
- Vortex-assisted and streaming

$$\begin{split} \rho_d(a,z) &= \epsilon \rho_0 \, (S+1)^{3/2} \, \exp\left\{-\frac{\left[a^2 f^2(\chi) + z^2\right]}{2 H^2} (S+1)\right\} \\ \text{Lyra \& Lin (2013)} \end{split}$$

- Vortex-trapped dust in drag-diffusion equilibrium explains the observations
- Rossby wave instability may be the culprit of these dust traps
- We're in the era of observational testing/confirmation of our model predictions!!
   Intensity (Jy/beam) 0.00 0.05 0.11 0.16 0.21 0.27 0.32





- Rossby wave instability may be the culprit of these dust traps
- We're in the era of observational testing/col of our model predictions!!



- Vortices exist in the dead zone only
- Two sustenance modes: Rossby Wave Insta
- Vortex-assisted and streamin
- Vortex-trapped dust in drag-diffusion equilibities
- Rossby wave instability may be the culprit of
- We're in the era of observational testing/confirmation
   of our model predictions!!



