Evolution of Circumstellar Disks and Planet Formation

Wladimir (Wlad) Lyra



Sagan Fellow

Caltech - JPL



Collaborators:

 Axel Brandenburg (Stockholm), Anders Johansen (Lund), Brandon Horn (Columbia), Hubert Klahr (Heidelberg), Marc Kuchner (Goddard), Min-Kai Lin (CITA) Mordecai-Mark Mac Low (AMNH), Sijme-Jan Paardekooper (Cambridge),
 Nikolai Piskunov (Uppsala), Natalie Raettig (Heidelberg), Zsolt Sandor (Innsbruck), Neal Turner (JPL), Andras Zsom (MIT).

Accretion in disks occurs via turbulent viscosity



Magneto-Rotational Instability



Video credit: Mario Flock (MPIA/CEA)

Particle drift



Pressure Trap



Adapted from Whipple (1972)

Pressure Trap



Stellocentric distance

Turbulence concentrates solids mechanically in pressure maxima



<u>Gravitational collapse into planetesimals</u>



Johansen et al. (2007)

Dead zones are robust features of accretion disks



Disks are cold and thus poorly ionized (Blaes & Balbus 1994)

Therefore, accretion is layered (Gammie 1996)

There should be a magnetized, active zone, and a non-magnetic, dead zone.



Lyra & Mac Low (2012)

Vortices – An ubiquitous fluid mechanics phenomenon







The energy cascade



Sustaining vortices

Mechanisms to *inject vorticity* to replenish the vorticity lost in the direct cascade





Rossby Wave Instability (or.... Kelvin-Helmholtz in rotating disks)















Elliptic instability





Infinitely elongated vortices are equivalent to **shear flows**. They are subject to an **MRI-like instability** when magnetized.

Convergence

Resolution



Lyra & Mac Low (2012)

High end computing



A new >100,000 proc supercluster - Stampede







Baroclinic Instability - Excitation and self-sustenance of vortices

1. Radial entropy gradient

2. Thermal diffusion

Sketch of the **Baroclinic Instability**

thermalization

vortex

to diffusion

dT___ / dφ ≠ 0

thermalization due



Lesur & Papaloizou (2010)



buoyant sinking,

roughly adiabatic

$$\frac{\partial \omega}{\partial t} = -(\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \omega - \omega (\nabla \cdot \mathbf{u}) + (\omega \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} + \frac{1}{\rho^2} \nabla \rho \times \nabla p + \nu \nabla^2 \omega$$

$$\downarrow \text{ compression } \text{ baroclinicity } \text{ baroclinicity } \text{ dissipation } \text{ dissi$$

entropy

gradient

Baroclinic Instability - Excitation and self-sustenance of vortices



Turbulent eddies concentrate solids, turning them into planetesimals...

...and vortices are huge eddies!



Particles do not feel the pressure gradient. They sink towards the center, where they accumulate.

Aid to planet formation (Barge & Sommeria 1995)

Speed up planet formation enormously (Lyra et al. 2008b, 2009a, 2009b, Raettig, Lyra & Klahr 2012)



Particles do not feel the pressure gradient. They sink towards the center, where they accumulate.

Aid to planet formation (Barge & Sommeria 1995)

Speed up planet formation enormously (Lyra et al. 2008b, 2009a, 2009b, Raettig, Lyra & Klahr 2012)

Vortices and Planet Formation



Collapse into Mars mass objects (Lyra et al. 2008b, 2009a, 2009b,

Rapid formation of planetary cores



Lambrechts & Johansen (2012)

A possible detection of vortices in disks?



And out of Science embargo on June 6th....



A Major Asymmetric Dust Trap in a Transition Disk

Nienke van der Marel,¹* Ewine F. van Dishoeck,^{1,2} Simon Bruderer,² Til Birnstiel,³ Paola Pinilla,⁴ Cornelis P. Dullemond,⁴ Tim A. van Kempen,^{1,5} Markus Schmalzl,¹ Joanna M. Brown,³ Gregory J. Herczeg,⁶ Geoffrey S. Mathews,¹ Vincent Geers⁷

The statistics of discovered exoplanets suggest that planets form efficiently. However, there are fundamental unsolved problems, such as excessive inward drift of particles in protoplanetary disks during planet formation. Recent theories invoke dust traps to overcome this problem. We report the detection of a dust trap in the disk around the star Oph IRS 48 using observations from the Atacama Large Millimeter/submillimeter Array (ALMA). The 0.44-millimeter-wavelength continuum map shows high-contrast crescent-shaped emission on one side of the star, originating from millimeter-sized grains, whereas both the mid-infrared image (micrometer-sized dust) and the gas traced by the carbon monoxide 6-5 rotational line suggest rings centered on the star. The difference in distribution of big grains versus small grains/gas can be modeled with a vortex-shaped dust trap triggered by a companion.

lthough the ubiquity of planets is con- tion mechanism of planetary systems in disks firmed almost daily by detections of of gas and dust around young stars remains a new exoplanets (1), the exact forma- long-standing problem in astrophysics (2). In

iencemag.org SCIENCE VOL 340 7 JUNE 2013

1199

Down

van der Marel et al. 2013

A possible huge vortex observed with ALMA







asymmetric mm dust at 63 AU

Gas detection: Keplerian rotation

Micron-sized dust follows gas

<u>Transitional disks – The thinning phase</u>



<u>Debris disks - The gas-poor phase</u>



Sharp and eccentric rings in debris disks: Signposts of planets



Narrow sharp eccentric ring

Detection of a source quickly heralded as a planet Fomalhaut b

Sharp and eccentric rings in debris disks: Signposts of planets

However.....

Foma

NASA

and M

 dol:10.1088/0004-637X/747/2/116

INFRARED NON-DETECTION OF FOMALHAUT 5: IMPLICATIONS FOR THE PLANET INTERPRETATION

MARKUS JANSON^{1,5}, JOSEPH C. CARSON², DAVID LAFRENIÈRE³, DAVID S. SPIEGEL⁴, JOHN R. BENT², AND PALMER WONG² ¹ Department of Astrophysical Sciences, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, USA; Janson@astro.princeton.edu ² College of Charleston, Charleston, WV, USA ³ Department of Physics, University of Montreal, Montreal, Canada ⁴ Institute for Advanced Studies, Princeton, NJ, USA *Received 2011 December 16*; accepted 2012 January 12; publiched 2012 February 23

ABSTRACT

The nearby A4-type star Fornalhaut hosts a debris belt in the form of an eccentric ring, which is thought to be caused by dynamical influence from a giant planet companion. In 2008, a detection of a point source inside the inner edge of the ring was reported and was interpreted as a direct image of the planet, named Fornalhaut b. The detection was made at ~600–800 nm, but no corresponding signatures were found in the near-infrared range, where the bulk emission of such a planet should be expected. Here, we present deep observations of Fornalhaut with *Spitzer*/IRAC at 4.5 μ m, using a novel point-spread function subtraction technique based on angular differential imaging and Locally Optimized Combination of Images, in order to substantially improve the *Spitzer* contrast at small separations. The results provide more than an order of magnitude improvement in the upper flux limit of Fornalhaut b and exclude the possibility that any flux from a giant planet surface contributes to the observed flux at visible wavelengths. This renders any direct connection between the observed light source and the dynamically inferred giant planet highly unlikely. We discuss several possible interpretations of the total body of observations of the Fornalhaut system and find that the interpretation that best matches the available data for the observed source is scattered light from a transient or semi-transient dust cloud.

Key words: circumstellar matter - planetary systems - stars: early-type

Online-only material: color figures

19a

Planet not detected in infrared

Sharp and eccentric rings in debris disks: Signposts of planets

However (take two).....

omalha

NASA. ESA.

and M. Clam

No

h.EP] 24 Oct 2012

Direct Imaging Confirmation and Characterization of a Dust-Enshrouded Candidate Exoplanet Orbiting Fomalhaut

Thayne Currie^{1,2}, John Debes³, Timothy J. Rodigas⁴, Adam Burrows⁵, Yoichi Itoh⁶, Misato Fukagawa⁷, Scott J. Kenyon⁸, Marc Kuchner², Soko Matsumura⁹

currie@astro.utoronto.ca

ABSTRACT

We present Subaru/IRCS J band data for Fomalhaut and a (re)reduction of archival 2004–2006 HST/ACS data first presented by Kalas et al. (2008). We confirm the existence of a candidate exoplanet, Fomalhaut b, in both the 2004 and 2006 F606W data sets at a high signal-to-noise. Additionally, we confirm

It should not have been detected anyway...



Some of the Fom b controversy

Janson et al. 2012

Variability by 0.7-0.8 mag in F606W band

Astrometric orbit not apsidally aligned with the ring

No infrared emission

Currie et al. 2012

No variability found within 0.15 mag in the same band

Consistent with apsidal alignment

Thermal emission from 0.5 MJ would not be detectable.

Observed optical emission requires reflection by **Something** of several Jupiter radii



Are there alternative explanations?

Debris disks are not completely gas-free



Gas in debris disks

			•	
D	01	ect	101	15
-	-			





Klahr & Lin (2005)

Suggested that an instability might cause dust in debris disks to clump together.

Particles move toward pressure maxima



Adapted from Whipple (1972)

Photoelectric heating

In optically thin debris disks, the **dust** is the **main heating agent** for the gas.



Dust intercepts starlight directly, emits electron, that heats the gas.

Gas is photoelectrically heated by the dust itself

Runaway process: instability



Dust heats gas

Heated gas = high pressure region

High pressure concentrates dust



Linear Analysis



Photoelectric Instability



Narrow hot dust rings Cold gas collects between rings

Photoelectric Instability

Dust heats gas Heated gas = high pressure region High pressure concentrates dust

3D Stratified



Photoelectric vs Streaming Instability

Dust heats gas Heated gas = high pressure region High pressure concentrates dust



Oscillations

Thermal coupling time



Solutions



Solutions



Damped and free Oscillations

Solutions



Damped and free Oscillations



The model in $r-\phi$: Eccentric rings





Radius

Epicyclic oscillations make the ring appear *eccentric !!!*



Lyra & Kuchner (2013, Nature, accepted)

Ring eccentricity



LETTER

Formation of sharp eccentric rings in debris disks with gas but without planets

W. Lyra^{1,2,3} & M. Kuchner⁴

'Debris disks' around young stars (analogues of the Kuiper Belt in our Solar System) show a variety of non-trivial structures attributed to planetary perturbations and used to constrain the properties of those planets¹⁻³. However, these analyses have largely ignored the fact that some debris disks are found to contain small quantities of gas⁴⁻⁹, a component that all such disks should contain at some level^{10,11}. Several debris disks have been measured with a dust-to-gas ratio of about unity⁴⁻⁹, at which the effect of hydrodynamics on the structure of the disk cannot be ignored^{12,13}. Here we report linear and nonlinear modelling that shows that dust-gas interactions can produce some of the key patterns attributed to planets. We find a robust clumping instability that organizes the dust into narrow, eccentric rings, similar to the Fomalhaut debris disk¹⁴. The conclusion that such disks might contain planets is not necessarily required to explain these systems.

Disks around young stars seem to pass through an evolutionary phase when the disk is optically thin and the dust-to-gas ratio ε ranges from 0.1 to 10. The nearby stars β Pictoris^{5,6,15–17}, HD32297 (ref. 7), 49 Ceti (ref. 4) and HD 21997 (ref. 9) all host dust disks resembling ordinary debris disks and also have stable circumstellar gas detected in molecular CO, Na I or other metal lines; the inferred mass of gas ranges from lunar masses to a few Earth masses (Supplementary Information). The gas in these disks is the useful to be produced by planetesimals or dust emission We present simulations of the fully compressible problem, solving for the continuity, Navier–Stokes and energy equations for the gas, and the momentum equation for the dust. Gas and dust interact dynamically through a drag force, and thermally through photoelectric heating. These are parametrized by a dynamical coupling time τ_f and a thermal coupling time τ_T (Supplementary Information). The simulations are performed with the Pencil Code^{21–24}, which solves the hydrodynamics on a grid. Two numerical models are presented: a three-dimensional box embedded in the disk that co-rotates with the flow at a fixed distance from the star; and a two-dimensional global model of the disk in the inertial frame. In the former the dust is treated as a fluid, with a separate continuity equation. In the latter the dust is represented by discrete particles with position and velocities that are independent of the grid.

We perform a stability analysis of the linearized system of equations that should help interpret the results of the simulations (Supplementary Information). We plot in Fig. 1a–c the three solutions that show linear growth, as functions of ε and n = kH, where k is the radial wavenumber and H is the gas scale height ($H = c_s / \sqrt{\gamma} \Omega_K$, where c_s is the sound speed, Ω_K the Keplerian rotation frequency and γ the adiabatic index). The friction time τ_f is assumed to be equal to $1/\Omega_K$. The left and middle panels show the growth and damping rates. The



Gravitational collapse of an interstellar cloud

Outward transport of angular momentum through turbulence generated by the MRI. Dust coagulates into pebbles and boulders, sedimenting towards the midplane.

Rocks in the turbulent medium are trapped in transient pressure maxima and undergo collapse into planetesimals and dwarf planets.

Vortices may be excited in the dead zone. Inside them, the first dozens of Marsmass embryos are formed. IMF \sim -2

Opacity transitions develop into regions of convergent migration. Low mass planets converge to these zones by inward/outward migration.

Convergent migration leads to resonances, these are disrupted by turbulent forcing. Collisions between embryos gives rise to oligarchs.

The disk thins due to photoevaporation. Planets released into stable orbits.

N-body interactions and stochastic forcing during disk evaporation produce the system's final architecture.

Debris disks with gas are subject to a thermo-centrifugal instability

The instability generates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.



Gravitational collapse of an interstellar cloud

Outward transport of angular momentum through turbulence generated by the MRI. Dust coagulates into pebbles and boulders, sedimenting towards the midplane.

Rocks in the turbulent medium are trapped in transient pressure maxima and undergo collapse interplanetesimals and dwarf planets. Solids



N-body interactions and stochastic forcing during disk evaporation produce the system's final architecture.

Debris disks with gas are subject to a thermo-centrifugal instability

The instability generates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.



Gravitational collapse of an interstellar cloud

Outward transport of angular momentum through turbulence generated by the MRI. Dust coagulates into pebbles and boulders, sedimenting towards the midplane.

Rocks in the turbulent medium are trapped in transient pressure maxima and undergo collapse into planetesimals and dwarf planets.

Vortices may be excited in the dead zone. Inside them, the first dozens of Marsmass embryos are formed. IMF ~ -2

Opacity transitio converge to thes





ons and stochastic forcing during disk evaporation produce the chitecture.

gas are subject to a thermo-centrifugal instability

-0.3 -0.2 -0.1 0.0 0.1 0.2 0.3 -0.2 -0.1 0.0 0.1 0.2 0.3 enerates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.



t=22.28 T_p

Summarizing

Gravitational collapse of an

Outward transport of angul MRI. Dust coagulates into p

Rocks in the turbulent medi undergo collapse into planet



e generated by the g towards the midplane.

ssure maxima and

4.00

Vortices may be excited in the dead zone. Inside them, the first dozens of Marsmass embryos are formed. IMF \sim -2



The instability generates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.



Gravitational collapse of

Outward transport of an MRI. Dust coagulates int

Rocks in the turbulent m undergo collapse into pla

Vortices may be excited mass embryos are forme



Opacity transitions develop into regions of convergent migration. Low mass planets converge to these zones by inward/outward migration.

Convergent migration leads to resonances, these are disrupted by turbulent forcing. Collisions between embryos gives rise to oligarchs.

The disk thins due to photoevaporation. Planets released into stable orbits.

N-body interactions and stochastic forcing during disk evaporation produce the system's final architecture.

Debris disks with gas are subject to a thermo-centrifugal instability

The instability generates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.



Gravitational collapse of an interstellar cloud

Outward transport of angular momentum through turbule. MRI. Dust coagulates into pebbles and boulders, sediment





forcing. Collisions between embryos gives rise to oligarchs

The disk thins due to photoevaporation. Planets released into stable orbits.

N-body interactions and stochastic forcing during disk evaporation produce the system's final architecture.

Debris disks with gas are subject to a thermo-centrifugal instability

The instability generates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.



ine.

:†S



(e)

(f)



Gravitational collapse of an interatellar alaud



Debris disks with gas are subject to a thermo-centrifugal instability

The instability generates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.





Debris disks with gas are subject to a photoelectric instability

The instability generates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.

In n



Gravitational collapse of an interstellar c

Outward transport of angular momentum, MRI. Dust coagulates into pebbles and bu

Rocks in the turbulent medium are trappundergo collapse into planetesimals and c

Vortices may be excited in the dead zone mass embryos are formed. IMF ~ -2

Opacity transitions develop into regions of convergent migration. Low mass planets converge to these zones by inward/outward migration.

Convergent migration leads to resonances, these are disrupted by turbulent forcing. Collisions between embryos gives rise to oligarchs.

The disk thins due to photoevaporation. Planets released into stable orbits.

N-body interactions and stochastic forcing during disk evaporation produce the system's final architecture.

Debris disks with gas are subject to a thermo-centrifugal instability

The instability generates sharp eccentric rings. Caution before shouting "planet!". Not all that glitters is gold.





Ring width

Ring spacing is determined by the wavelength of maximum growth.



Which in turn is determined by viscosity

Ring spacing ~ 10 Kolmogorov lengths



Linear and nonlinear growth



Linear growth only exists for $\varepsilon < 1$

But there is nonlinear growth beyond !

"Elliptic" Instability





Lesur & Papaloizou (2010)

See also Pierrehumbert 1986 Bayly 1986 Kerswell 2002 Lesur & Papaloizoy 2009 Lesur & Papaloizou 2010 Lyra & Klahr 2011 Lyra 2013

Infinitely elongated vortices are equivalent to shear flows. They are subject to an MRI-like instability when magnetized.

